

Evaluation of the Restructuring Policy for the Relocation of Street Vendors (PKL) in Bojonegoro, Indonesia

Adinda Ayu Enjelina^{1*}, Ahmad Supratyo², Junadi³

¹²³Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik, Universitas Bojonegoro, Indonesia

Email: adindaenjelina302@gmail.com ; tiyopras207@gmail.com ; junadiunigoro2017@gmail.com

Abstract. This study aims to evaluate the effectiveness of the street vendor control policy (PKL) on Street Kartini, Bojonegoro Regency. This policy is designed to create a more orderly, comfortable trade environment and support economic activities without disturbing the aesthetics of the city and public order. This study uses a descriptive qualitative method with a case study approach. Data was collected through in-depth interviews with street vendors, direct observation at the relocation site, and analysis of policy documents and implementation reports from related agencies. The study results show that this policy has successfully achieved several targets in strategic locations such as Street Kartini, where traders reported an increase in customer visits and revenue. However, the effectiveness of this policy is still uneven, especially in other locations such as Street Rajekwesi and Veteran, which are considered less strategic and lack adequate facilities. The main challenges of this policy include traders' resistance to relocation, lack of supporting facilities, and weak supervision of policy implementation. To improve the success of the policy, the government is advised to improve inter-agency coordination, improve facilities at relocation sites, and actively involve traders in the planning and evaluation process. These measures are expected to ensure that the policy provides fair economic benefits for merchants while improving the aesthetics of the city and public order.

Keywords: Vendor Regulation; Relocation; Policy Evaluation

Received:26-11-2024 **Revised:**24-12-2024 **Accepted:**30-12-2024

INTRODUCTION

Street vendors as one of the main components of micro businesses involved in informal sector businesses (Zulhijahyanti et al., 2021). Street vendors (PKL) are an important part of the informal sector in Indonesia, contributing to job creation and access to affordable goods and services for the community (Budiman, 2021). The informal business sector tends to be easier to form because this sector produces and distributes goods or services so that it is able to generate income for its actors. Not only that, this sector also contributes to creating local economic dynamics that strengthen the traditional market ecosystem and reflect the diversity of consumption culture in Indonesia (Haris, 2024). In its operations, the informal sector in general has not been well structured because it has not utilized formal facilities and institutions (Dewi Andini et al., 2022). This phenomenon gives rise to polarization in policy approaches: between the "order" paradigm that emphasizes order and aesthetics of the city, and the "empowerment" paradigm that prioritizes the socio-economic aspects of traders.

The phenomenon of street vendors (PKL) is a global reality that is the main challenge in urban governance, with street vendors as a significant component. The International Labour Organization (ILO) reported that the COVID-19 pandemic has pushed the number of street vendors in major cities around the world due to layoffs and limited formal employment by up to 38% (ILO, 2020). The existence of street vendors is often a challenge for every region or city, especially related to spatial planning and regulations that can cause an imbalance between the formal and informal sectors (Sintani et al., 2023). Street vendors often sell in public areas that should not be used for trading, such as sidewalks, roadsides, squares, or other locations that are not suitable (Rosandi Sakir et al., 2024). This condition often causes congestion, visual chaos, and damages the aesthetics of the city. The arrangement of public spaces that are not optimal for trading activities can reduce comfort and limit their access to public facilities (Arifin et al., 2021). The relocation policy of street vendors must be based on the principle of community economic empowerment and improving the welfare of traders (Junadi & Lukita, 2023). In addition, the unplanned use of public space for trade activities can reduce the quality of life of the surrounding community (Kristian, 2021).

Bojonegoro faces a similar dynamic in the arrangement of street vendors in the square area. The arrangement of street vendors (PKL) in Bojonegoro Regency aims to create a safe, clean, orderly, and comfortable environment, in line with the applicable legal foundation. As a reference, Permendagri Number 41 of 2012 concerning Guidelines for the Structuring and Empowerment of Street Vendors provides general guidelines in the structuring and empowerment of street vendors throughout Indonesia. At the regional level, Bojonegoro Regency has a special regulation, namely Regional Regulation (Perda) Number 15 of 2015 concerning the Implementation of Peace and Public Order which is the basis for efforts to organize street vendors. The implementation of public policies must pay attention to the aspects of coordination between stakeholders and community involvement to achieve the effectiveness of the programs carried out (Rupiarsieh & Mustiana., 2023). The implementation of this arrangement is based on the reason that many street vendors are active in prohibited locations, such as road shoulders and sidewalks, which can interfere with the function of public spaces and the safety of road users.

In addition, there is also Bojonegoro Regency Regional Regulation Number 3 of 2006 and Regent Regulation Number 14 of 2008 which technically regulates the regulation, arrangement of business places, and the development of street vendors. This arrangement effort includes determining, moving, controlling, and regulating the location of street vendors and considering aspects of public interest, social, aesthetic, health, economy, security, order, and environmental

cleanliness. In the study of governance, the structuring of the informal sector requires a comprehensive approach by considering social, economic, and urban spatial aspects in an integrated manner (Taufiq & Kasiami, 2022).

The success of the street vendor restructuring program is highly dependent on the readiness of the new location and the public's acceptance of the policy (Septian & Wulandari, 2023). Policy implementation often faces various challenges, both in terms of law enforcement, merchant resistance, and limited facilities provided. (Fristi Arsanía et al., 2024) Therefore, it is very important to evaluate the policy of structuring street vendors on Street Kartini to find out the effectiveness of the policies that have been implemented, to know the obstacles faced in the field, and to formulate recommendations for policy improvement in order to be able to accommodate the interests of all parties. In simple terms, policy evaluation according to William Dunn in (Nadila, 2023) Regarding the production of information about the value or benefits of policy outcomes. Policy evaluation not only measures the success of the program, but also identifies obstacles and potential improvements for better implementation. (Suprastiyo & Kumala Sari, 2022)

In evaluating public policy, several important aspects must be considered, as explained by William Dunn (Fika et al., 2023). The first aspect is the public policy itself, which includes the substance or content of the policy, such as goals, objectives, and rules applied to achieve certain results. Furthermore, the policy implementation aspect focuses on the process of implementing policies in the field, including the suitability of its implementation with the initial plan and the obstacles faced. Another aspect that is no less important is the public policy environment, namely external factors such as social, political, economic, and cultural conditions that can affect the success or failure of policies. Finally, public policy performance measures the extent to which policy goals are achieved, including effectiveness, efficiency, and benefits felt by the community. By considering these four aspects, policy evaluation can be carried out thoroughly to find out the advantages and disadvantages of the policies taken, so that it can be the basis for improvement for future policies.

Dunn's policy evaluation theory in (Nadila, 2023), which offers six evaluation indicators to assess the effectiveness of a policy: effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, fairness, responsiveness, and precision. Effectiveness focuses on the extent to which the policy achieves the expected results. Efficiency measures the amount of effort required to achieve this outcome, usually by calculating the cost per unit of service or product. Adequacy assesses whether the policy is able to meet needs or solve the problems faced. Justice emphasizes the fair distribution of policy results among target groups. Responsiveness is related to the community's response to

the policy, either in the form of support or rejection. Finally, accuracy is used to determine whether the policy outcome is a choice that is by the planned objectives.

Problems in the field related to the policy of structuring street vendors (PKL) in Bojonegoro Regency show several obstacles based on six indicators from Dunn's policy evaluation theory in (Nadila, 2023). The data, which is the result of this initial observation, reveals that the policy has not been fully effective, as seen from the fact that there are still street vendors who return to sell in prohibited areas even though they have been relocated. This is due to a lack of supervision and new locations that are not by the needs of street vendors. In terms of efficiency, there are obstacles in the implementation of policies, especially in the rearrangement of locations and control procedures that are carried out repeatedly without ensuring compliance in the long term. In terms of responsiveness, the government did not take firm action against street vendors who were reluctant to move out of the restricted area, so the policy was not fully complied with. Finally, the policy is considered inappropriate because it is not in accordance with the socio-economic characteristics of street vendors; The new location far from the center of the crowd makes it difficult for them to attract customers.

Research by (Kristian, 2021) Regarding the evaluation of the policy of arranging street vendors on Street Kiara Condong, Bandung City, it shows that although several criteria for arranging street vendors such as effectiveness and efficiency have been met, the implementation of the policy is still not optimal, especially in supervision, data collection, and planning. The results of this study propose the need for government firmness in supervision and active participation of street vendors to increase the effectiveness of street vendor arrangements. Various studies related to the arrangement of other street vendors also reveal gaps that need to be explored further. Research by (Rohmawati & Harsono, 2024) in Gunungkidul Regency, highlighting the limited capacity of street vendor relocation locations but not discussing the social and economic impacts of post-relocation. (Pristika & Kurniawan, 2021) noted policy constraints in East Java, such as the low awareness of street vendors, but did not delve into the dynamics of communication between the government and street vendors. (Aini & Yuwanto, 2024) in Semarang reviews policies based on input and impact indicators, but lacks a review of the influence of policies on the welfare of street vendors, especially income. This research lies in the focus on the local context and socio-economic dynamics in Bojonegoro Regency. This study not only evaluates the policy of restructuring street vendors in terms of effectiveness and efficiency, but also pays attention to the impact of the policy on the welfare of street vendors after relocation,

which can provide new insights related to their socio-economic adaptation in facing changes in business places.

By considering the importance of the role of street vendors (PKL) in the regional economy and the challenges faced in arranging public spaces, this research is expected to provide in-depth insight into the effectiveness of the policy of structuring street vendors on Street Kartini, Bojonegoro Regency. The focus of this research includes an analysis of six policy evaluation indicators, namely effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy. This research will also explore the socio-economic impact of the policies implemented and the challenges faced in their implementation. The results of this study are expected not only to provide constructive recommendations for local governments in formulating better street vendor management policies, but also to contribute to the development of theories and practices for sustainable management of public spaces. Thus, this research is expected to be a reference for decision-makers, academics, and other related parties to create a more orderly, orderly, and productive environment for the parties involved.

METHODS

This study uses a descriptive qualitative approach to understand and describe the arrangement of street vendors on Street Kartini, Bojonegoro Regency. The informants in this study were determined using the purposive sampling technique, which is to select the informants deliberately based on certain criteria that are relevant to the research objectives. Informants are selected based on their roles and experience in the street vendor structuring and relocation policy. Satpol PP members provided views related to the implementation of policies in the field, including the challenges of interaction with street vendors and the effectiveness of policies from the perspective of implementers. The Head of the Trade, Cooperatives, and Micro Enterprises Office conveyed information about policy objectives, decision-making processes, implementation strategies, and indicators of program success. On-site traders were selected to describe the impact of the relocation policy on revenue, business continuity, and their dependence on the accessibility of the location and street customers.

The data collection technique was carried out through in-depth interviews, direct observation in the field, and analysis of documents related to spatial planning policies issued by the local government. The data analysis technique used in this study follows the Miles and Huberman Model method in (Utomo & Damayanti, 2019). This research includes three main stages, namely data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. This research was conducted based on a thorough analysis to evaluate the policy of structuring Street Vendors (PKL) on Street

Kartini, Bojonegoro Regency, as well as the impacts and challenges that arise in the process. The results of this study are expected to provide insight for local governments and stakeholders in formulating more effective and sustainable policies.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Evaluation determines how well a program achieves its goals and makes efficient use of resources.(Vasthi et al., 2024) (Harahap et al., 2024). Evaluation is a systematic process to assess the extent to which a policy or program achieves the goals that have been set (Phafiandita et al., 2022). In this study, the evaluation of the policy of restructuring the relocation of street vendors (PKL) in Bojonegoro Regency, especially on Street Kartini, was carried out based on six main indicators put forward by Dunn, namely effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy (Nadila, 2023). Each of these indicators was analyzed to find out the extent to which the policy of restructuring street vendors on Street Kartini has met the expectations of the Bojonegoro Regency government. This discussion includes the implementation of policies, the challenges faced, and their impact on street vendors and local communities. The results of this evaluation are expected to provide a comprehensive overview of policy implementation and provide recommendations for improvements for similar relocation policies in the future.

The Effectiveness of the Street Vendor Arrangement Policy on Kartini Street, Bojonegoro Regency

Policy effectiveness is a combination of careful planning, proper implementation, and continuous evaluation and adjustment to ensure that policy objectives can be well achieved (Yunitasari et al., 2023). The effectiveness of the relocation policy of street vendors on Street Kartini is assessed based on the extent to which the policy is able to achieve the goals that have been set. The main objectives of this policy include improving order, and providing strategic and convenient locations for street vendors. The results of the interviews show that the relocation policy has succeeded in achieving its main goal in a strategic location such as Street Kartini. Relocation creates a more organized area, supports trade activities, and increases traders' income. Some traders admitted that their customers increased after being relocated to Street Kartini. However, this policy has not been fully effective in other relocation locations such as on Street Rajekwesi and Veteran. In the area, traders feel that the new location is less in demand by buyers, so many leave the location and return to their place of origin or look for a new location independently.

This shows that the relocation policy has had a positive impact on traders in the location, both in terms of revenue and the number of customers. In line with research (Akbar et al., 2021) which shows that in some locations such as the Makassar Main Market, relocation is able to increase traders' income through an increase in the number of customers. However, effectiveness has not been fully achieved in other locations such as Rajekwesi, where traders feel the location is quiet and less strategic. Research (Mukhlis & Abdulkadir, 2022) Note that unstrategic locations often reduce the number of customers and negatively impact merchants' revenue. The achievement of the goal of the relocation policy of street vendors in Bojonegoro Regency, especially on Street Kartini, can be assessed through the direct experience of traders affected by the policy. Street vendors who previously sold in front of SMPN 7 and have now been moved to Street Kartini, explained that the changes show that the relocation to Street Kartini has a positive impact in terms of increasing the number of buyers and trade flows, which has an impact on increasing traders' income. This shows that the relocation location on Street Kartini is more strategic, more visitors come to buy products sold by street vendors.

The effectiveness of the relocation policy of street vendors on Street Kartini is reflected in the stability of traders' trading activities. Yoga stated that while selling at this relocation location, he did not encounter any significant obstacles so that he felt comfortable in carrying out his activities. The relocation on Street Kartini has a positive impact on the order and tranquility of the area. With this policy, congestion that previously often occurred in the old area has been successfully reduced. A more orderly location arrangement has succeeded in reducing congestion in the area around Street Kartini, although there are still traffic violations at several points. This indicates the need for further supervision to ensure that relocation rules are complied with by all parties.

The relocation of street vendors on Street Kartini also has a positive impact on order and tranquility in public spaces. Before this policy was enforced, many traders were selling in locations that were not allowed, such as sidewalks and shoulder roads, thus disturbing road users. With an organized location, merchants not only feel safer, but also help create a better aesthetic of the city. This policy also has a positive impact on the comfort of the community. Relocation locations such as Street Kartini are arranged in such a way to provide various needs in one area, so that it is more convenient for consumers. The community feels helped by the availability of centralized, clean, and easily accessible trade facilities. In addition, the well-organized area also contributes to the improvement of the aesthetics of the city, thereby providing added value for the comfort of the surrounding environment.

Although the relocation policy of street vendors on Street Kartini has shown positive results in several aspects, there are several obstacles that hinder the effectiveness of its implementation. One of the main obstacles is the resistance of traders to new locations that they consider quiet or less strategic, so they are not able to attract a sufficient number of visitors. This causes many traders to be reluctant to settle in the location that has been provided by the government. In addition, the attractiveness of the relocation location outside Street Kartini is considered inadequate, which causes traders to have difficulty maintaining their businesses. As a result, most merchants tend to return to old locations that they consider more advantageous in terms of access and number of visitors.

Efficiency of Street Vendor Arrangement Policy on Kartini Street, Bojonegoro Regency

The efficiency of the relocation policy of street vendors in Bojonegoro Regency is assessed based on three main subindicators: resource utilization, operational costs, and time utilization. Although this policy has advantages, such as the government's efforts to provide basic facilities in the form of tents, electricity, and clean water, its implementation still needs improvement. Coordination of agencies, such as the Trade Office, Urban Village, and Satpol PP, is the main challenge. According to the Head of Satpol PP, inconsistent coordination hinders the efficient use of human resources and infrastructure. In some relocation locations, such as Street Kartini, basic facilities have been available, but in other locations, such as Rajekwesi, the facilities are still not optimal, which have an impact on traders' activities. In terms of operational costs, this policy is relatively economical compared to the construction of new business places. The government bears most of the costs, such as the provision of tents and electricity, while traders are only charged a light fee for cleanliness and electricity. One of them mentioned the cost of association dues of Rp25,000 per month and electricity of Rp15,000 per cart, even though clean water facilities are not yet fully available.

The government seeks to involve traders in the management of facilities through joint contributions, reflecting an inclusive approach. However, the efficiency of this policy can be improved by equipping basic facilities at all relocation sites and strengthening coordination between agencies to ensure more optimal resource allocation. The voluntary contribution mechanism through the chairman of the association also shows the existence of participatory management in supporting the implementation of policies (Hanum et al., 2024). However, challenges arise in the form of differences in strategic relocation locations and locations that are considered less dense. In locations such as Street Kartini, the contribution of traders is more stable due to their high trading activity. Zoning of traders and relocation to more regular locations

can affect the stability of traders' contributions, many are reluctant to occupy new locations if they are considered less strategic (Ningsih & Megawati, 2022). On the other hand, in locations such as Rajekwesi, the lack of visitors makes traders reluctant to survive and contribute to the management of cleanliness and other facilities. This shows that the effectiveness of operational financing is highly dependent on the attractiveness of the relocation location.

The use of time in the implementation of relocation policies is a crucial aspect that affects overall efficiency. This process includes long stages, ranging from socialization, negotiation, to traders' adjustment to the new location. Resistance from affected parties often arises, especially related to concerns about a decrease in income due to location changes. This suggests that a lack of understanding and uncertainty over the benefits of the policy can be a significant obstacle to implementation. The socialization and negotiation stages require an effective persuasive approach to overcome resistance and increase acceptance. This process also aims to provide certainty that the relocation not only creates a more organized environment, but also supports economic activities in the long term. Although it will take longer, these adjustments are important to ensure policies are implemented in an inclusive manner, taking into account the needs and concerns of affected parties. The success of the relocation is highly dependent on continuous communication and the provision of adequate facilities at the new location in order to meet the expectations of all parties. The relocation process takes a long time because of the preparation stages, such as determining the location and building basic facilities. Nevertheless, the government has made efforts to accelerate in several parts so that the implementation can be completed according to the set time target.

Adequacy of Street Vendor Arrangement Policy on Kartini Street, Bojonegoro Regency

The adequacy of the relocation policy of street vendors in Bojonegoro Regency is assessed based on three sub-indicators, namely the fulfillment of the needs of street vendors, location accessibility, The results of the study show that efforts to meet the basic needs of street vendors have been carried out well in several relocation locations, although there is a significant difference between strategic locations and locations with low attractiveness.

Fulfilling the basic needs of street vendors (PKL) is one of the priorities in the relocation policy in Bojonegoro Regency. The government has provided various facilities at the relocation site, especially on Street Kartini, to support the sustainability of trade activities. Access to clean water is fulfilled through the provision of services from PDAM. This is important to support the cleanliness of the stalls and the operational needs of traders, such as cleaning cooking utensils and keeping goods clean (Persada et al., 2023). The Bojonegoro Regency Government has

taken significant steps in providing basic facilities for street vendors located at the relocation site, such as clean water, electricity, and a decent place to trade. The Head of Satpol PP Bojonegoro explained that clean water facilities have been provided at the relocation location, so traders do not have to worry about their water needs. The provision of clean water through PDAMs and electricity assistance, especially for traders who cannot afford it, reflects the government's efforts to meet the basic needs of traders. Although the installation cost and monthly fees for clean water are borne by traders, this step still shows the government's commitment to supporting the business continuity of traders. Additional facilities such as tents and tables are also provided to create a more comfortable and efficient trading space, ensuring the comfort and safety of traders in running their businesses.

The adequacy of the relocation policy for street vendors in Bojonegoro Regency can be seen from the fulfillment of various basic needs provided by the government, such as clean water and electricity facilities. The government through PDAM provides clean water facilities that allow traders to access water easily at no additional cost, although the operational costs are still covered through the contributions of the traders' association. Electricity facilities are also provided at no additional cost that burdens traders, supporting their smooth operations, especially for lighting at night.

The placement of traders on Street Kartini is considered very strategic because it has good accessibility but does not interfere with the main traffic flow. This location is considered ideal for relocation because even though it is not located in a heavy traffic lane, Street Kartini is quite feasible and has adequate connectivity with crowded areas. The government's decision to choose this location proved to support the increase in traders' income, as the location was more convenient and strategically make it easier for traders to run their business without interference from the authorities and increase consumer comfort in shopping

In addition, the government also ensures that traders at the relocation location get adequate facilities to sell, such as tables and tents that are tailored to their needs. This facility ensures that traders can run their businesses comfortably and efficiently. The government also prioritizes cleanliness by providing public trash cans and requiring traders to maintain the cleanliness of the environment around their stalls. This policy creates a comfortable, neat, and clean environment, which of course affects consumer comfort. However, the successful management of this facility also requires good coordination between relevant agencies and traders to ensure that the facility is used optimally. The government continues to conduct routine evaluations of the condition of existing facilities and facilities, in order to adjust to the needs that may arise in the field.

Equitable Arrangement Policy for Street Vendors on Kartini Street, Bojonegoro Regency

The policy of structuring fair street vendors on Kartini Street, Bojonegoro Regency aims to ensure that all street vendors have equal access to a decent and strategic selling location. The equivalence theory put forward by Titmuss in (Stewart, 2020) The concept of social justice explains that public policy must pay attention to distributive justice, where every community group gets equal access to resources. This policy is designed so that relocation not only creates order and beauty in the area, but also provides a fair opportunity for traders to continue to run their businesses without experiencing a significant decrease in income. The division of trading locations in the relocation policy of street vendors in Bojonegoro Regency is carried out through a lottery mechanism to ensure a fair distribution of places. This drawing process is intended so that all traders have an equal chance to get a location. The Head of Satpol PP Bojonegoro Regency explained that this draw is important so that no traders are privileged. In addition, the location on Street Kartini chosen for relocation is arranged according to the needs and capacity of each trader. In this location, the trading place is adjusted to the type of trader's business, considering the limited space available. For example, a trader who sells goods with a smaller space requirement is only given a place according to his needs, not more than that.

However, although the venue division procedure has been designed to guarantee fairness, the reality on the ground shows that there is dissatisfaction from some traders. Some traders feel that the location they receive is less strategic and does not support their trading activities. One of the traders said that justice in this policy must prioritize the public interest, not personal wishes, although this makes some traders feel dissatisfied. As a result, some traders who felt their location was less favorable chose to return to their original place. This shows that although there is procedural fairness in the division of places, the factor of strategic location attractiveness remains very important for the success of relocation policies.

The government has provided various facilities to support this relocation policy, such as tents, electricity, clean water, and garbage cans. A mentoring program for traders is also carried out to ensure they understand the benefits and applicable rules. One of the other government supports is the productive merchant card program which allows traders to access interest-free loans of up to IDR 2.5 million for business development. However, the distribution of this support is still uneven. Locations such as Street Kartini received more attention in terms of facilities and promotions, while other locations, such as Rajekwesi, felt that they received less equal attention. This is a big challenge in ensuring that this relocation policy can provide fair support for all traders, not just in more strategic locations.

Responsiveness of Street Vendor Arrangement Policy on Kartini Street, Bojonegoro Regency

The responsiveness of the street vendor relocation policy in Bojonegoro Regency was analyzed based on three subindicators which included the response of street vendors, community response, and complaint handling mechanism. Responsiveness reflects the extent to which the policy is able to respond to the needs and expectations of traders, the community, and related parties (Indraswari et al., 2024). The results of the study show that there is a difference in response levels in strategic locations such as Street Kartini compared to other locations. The response of street vendors to the relocation policy varies depending on the location of the relocation location location they occupy. Traders on Street Kartini generally give a positive response because the location is considered strategic, crowded with visitors, and supports increasing their income. From the perspective of the community, the relocation policy on Street Kartini received a positive response. A neatly arranged, clean, and centralized location makes it easier for people to meet their needs in one place. In addition, the better aesthetics of the city thanks to the arrangement of street vendors also increases the comfort of the community when doing activities in the area.

The relocation policy of street vendors in Bojonegoro Regency shows various dynamics in its implementation. In the early stages of implementation, even though the government has made communication efforts, pros and cons among traders still occur. This is mainly because some merchants have had regular customers in the old location. The Head of the Bojonegoro Regency Trade Office (2024) explained that after being given an explanation of the purpose of relocation to improve the comfort of traders and buyers, most traders began to understand and accept the policy.

The complaint handling mechanism, which involves the association chairman as a representative of traders, the government, and access through direct reports or communication media such as WhatsApp, shows an inclusive and responsive approach. This provides space for traders to submit complaints or inputs. As a form of education, the government also provides directions to new traders regarding the rules for selling at the relocation location. The impact of this policy on the general public is mostly positive. The relocation of street vendors to a centralized location, such as Street Kartini, creates a more orderly and comfortable environment. In addition, the community feels benefits in the form of reduced chaos on the road and public areas. The Head of the Bojonegoro Regency Trade Office added that this move provides convenience for buyers because commercial products are now available in one organized

location. Responsiveness in solving problems can also be seen from how conflicts or challenges in new locations are usually resolved internally through the head of the association.

Overall, although initial challenges such as vendor resistance and location disparity are still an issue, the Bojonegoro Regency government has shown significant efforts in creating organized relocations and supporting street vendors. Facility support, education, and intensive communication are the main pillars in the success of this policy. However, continuous evaluation is needed to address the disparities in benefits between relocation sites and ensure the sustainability of these policies.

This shows that the existing complaint system relies more on the role of the chairman of the association as a liaison between traders and the government. This approach is effective in overcoming technical problems that often arise, such as fair location allocation and meeting the needs of additional facilities. With the chairman of the association as an intermediary, the delivery of traders' aspirations becomes more structured and can be prioritized according to their urgency.

Accuracy of the Arrangement Policy for Street Street Vendors on Street Kartini, Bojonegoro Regency

Accuracy is the extent to which an action, policy, or decision is in accordance with the goal or problem to be overcome, as well as relevant and effective in achieving the desired outcome (Mesiono et al., 2024). In the context of a policy or program, precision refers to the suitability of the solutions offered to the needs and situations faced, so that they can provide optimal and sustainable benefits for the desired goals (Aulia et al., 2023). Accuracy is measured through indicators such as the suitability of the solution, the long-term impact, and the benefits felt by related parties. The relocation policy of street vendors in Bojonegoro Regency is a strategic step aimed at overcoming various problems, such as urban chaos, irregularity in trade activities, and disruption to the aesthetics of the city. In terms of the accuracy of the problem, according to the Head of Satpol PP Bojonegoro Regency, the relocation policy of street vendors in Bojonegoro Regency has succeeded in answering the main problems faced, namely the chaos and irregularity of trade activities, especially in areas such as Bojonegoro Square.

In terms of the accuracy of the target, this policy has succeeded in targeting street vendors who previously sold in unofficial locations and disrupted public order. The relocation to Street Kartini provides a more decent, safe, and comfortable place for traders. However, the effectiveness of this policy is uneven across all locations. For example, locations such as Rajekwesi are less successful because they are considered unstrategic and empty of buyers.

This shows that the accuracy of the target is highly dependent on the selection of locations that have sufficient economic potential and market attractiveness.

In terms of the accuracy of implementation, this policy has been quite effective in providing basic facilities such as tents, access to clean water, and garbage cans at the relocation site. This facility makes it easier for traders to adapt to the new environment and increases the convenience of shoppers. However, the implementation of this policy is still not optimal in terms of promotion and supporting activities. The absence of official events or promotions from the government has led to a lack of attraction in some locations, such as Rajekwesi. This shows that the implementation of the policy must be supported with additional measures to increase buyer visits and create a more dynamic atmosphere at the relocation site.

In terms of the accuracy of benefits, this policy has a positive impact on strategic locations, such as Street Kartini, where urban order is created, the comfort of traders and buyers, and the improvement of the aesthetics of the area. However, the benefits of this policy have not been fully felt in locations such as Rajakwasi, which still face the problem of low trade activity. The mismatch between the location and the market potential indicates an imbalance in the distribution of benefits, which needs to be corrected immediately so that this policy can have an even impact. In terms of efficiency accuracy, this policy is efficient in allocating resources to create an organized and comfortable trading space in several locations. However, the efficiency of this policy is reduced in less strategic locations, such as Rajekwesi, which requires further intervention so that economic activities can run more optimally. The government needs to consider the aspects of market attractiveness and the economic potential of each location to improve the efficiency of this policy.

Overall, the relocation policy of street vendors in Bojonegoro Regency has succeeded in overcoming most of the problems that are the focus of the policy, especially in strategic locations such as Street Kartini. However, to achieve equitable and sustainable results, further evaluation of less strategic relocation locations is needed. The government also needs to increase promotions and support trade activities to ensure the attractiveness of the relocation location for traders and customers. In the long term, a data-driven approach and analysis of the economic potential of each location can increase the effectiveness of these policies, create broader benefits, and ensure the sustainability of relocation policies in Bojonegoro Regency.

CONCLUSION

The policy of structuring Street Vendors (PKL) on Street Kartini, Bojonegoro Regency has succeeded in achieving several main goals, especially in terms of improving the order of the area

and the income of traders in strategic locations. This relocation creates a more orderly, comfortable, and supportive trading environment, which is reflected in the increase in the number of customers on Street Kartini. However, this policy has not shown its effectiveness or even been seen, especially in other locations such as Street Rajekwesi and Veteran. The location is considered less strategic, so traders experience a significant decrease in income. This obstacle shows the need for a more in-depth evaluation of the location selection before relocation is carried out. In addition, there are still challenges in the form of a lack of supporting facilities in some locations and weak supervision in policy implementation. The government's efforts in providing basic facilities such as tents, clean water, and electricity need to be increased, especially in locations that are less in demand by customers. In order for this policy to run more effectively and sustainably, the government is advised to strengthen coordination between agencies, increase the attractiveness of relocation locations through promotion and incentives, and involve the active participation of traders in the planning and evaluation process. With these measures, it is hoped that this policy will not only improve the aesthetics of the city, but also provide equal economic benefits for all traders.

REFERENCE

- Aini, A. A., & Yuwanto. (2024). Evaluasi Kebijakan Peraturan Daerah Nomor 3 Tahun 2018 Tentang. *Journal Of Politic And Government Studies*, 13(3), 495–507. <https://fisip.undip.ac.id>
- Akbar, A., Tahir, M., & Haq, N. (2021). Efektifitas Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Kota Makassar. *Kajian Ilmiah Mahasiswa Administrasi Publik (KIMAP)*, 2(4), 1398–1411. <https://journal.unismuh.ac.id/index.php/kimap/index>
- Arifin, Kadir, I., Ode Amrul Hasan, L., & Ma'ruf, A. (2021). *Studi Penataan Permukiman Pesisir Lamanggau Di Pulau Tolandono Kecamatan Tomia Kabupaten Wakatobi Sebagai Kawasan Wisata Yang Berkelanjutan*. 116–128.
- Aulia, W., Santosa, I., Ihsan, M., & Nugraha, A. (2023). Utilizing The Appropriate Technology Paradigm In Industrial Design: A Literature Review. *Jurnal Desain Indonesia*, 70–86. <https://doi.org/10.52265/jdi.v5i2.276>
- Budiman, I. (2021). Analisis Potensi Perekonomian Pedagang Kaki-Lima Di Kota Langsa. *Jurnal Samudra Ekonomi Dan Bisnis*, 12(2), 184–199. <https://doi.org/10.33059/jseb.v12i2.3043>
- Dewi Andini, L., Taufik Hidayat, R., & Boru Hotang, K. (2022). Diklat Pembuatan Laporan Keuangan Bagi Pelaku Usaha Informal (Pedagang Kaki Lima) Se-Kota Bekasi. *Desember*, 1(3). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.56127/jammu.v1i3.322>
- Fika, N., Fauzi, A., Qurtubi, A., Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten, U., Jendral Sudirman, J. N., Cipocok Jaya Kec Serang, P., & Serang, K. (2023). Analisis Kebijakan Versi William Dunn Dalam Pondok Pesantren Modern. *Journal on Education*, 05(04), 16737–16747.
- Fristi Arsania, R., Pramita Gurning, F., Penelitian, A., Kunci, K., & Tanpa Rokok, K. (2024). Analisis Kebijakan Kawasan Tanpa Rokok Guna Menunjang Pola Hidup Sehat Pada Masyarakat Kota Medan Sumatera Utara. *Analysis Of Smoke-Free Area Policy To Support*

- Healthy Lifestyle Patterns In Medan City Community, North Sumatera. *Ju Jurnal Kolaboratif Sains*, 7(9), 3459–3470. <https://doi.org/10.56338/jks.v7i9.5983>
- Hanum, F., Yana, S., & Mauliza, P. (2024). *Pemberdayaan Masyarakat Pedagang Kaki Lima Dalam Meningkatkan Perekonomian*. Mega Press Nusantara.
- Harahap, H., Zulqaidah, Rama Satya Tanjung, Khairul Amri Silalahi, & Muhammad Iqbal. (2024). Model Evaluasi Dalam Program Pendidikan. *Indo-MathEdu Intellectuals Journal*, 5(3), 3382–3391. <https://doi.org/10.54373/imeij.v5i3.1364>
- Haris, M. (2024). Interaksi Sosial Dan Jaringan Ekonomi Pedagang Kaki Lima Dalam Konteks Perubahan Ekonomi Lokal. *Jurnal Masyarakat Madani*, 9, 84–98. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.24014/jmm.v9i1.29779>
- ILO. (2020). *Pemantauan Ilo Edisi Ke-2: Covid-19 Dan Dunia Kerja*. <https://gisanddata.maps.arcgis.com/apps/opsdashboard/index.html#/>
- Indraswari, G. A., Anjani, R. R., & Jamal, A. (2024). Evaluasi Keputusan Pemerintah Melalui Pasar Murah Dalam Menjaga Stabilisasi Harga Bahan Pokok Di Surabaya. *Indonesian Journal of Public Administration Review*, 1(2), 14. <https://doi.org/10.47134/par.v1i2.2420>
- Junadi, & Lukita, C. (2023). Evaluasi Program Pemberdayaan Masyarakat Dalam Penataan Pkl Di Kabupaten Bojonegoro. *Indonesian Journal of Public Policy*, 7(3), 89–102.
- Kristian, I. (2021). Evaluasi Kebijakan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima (Pkl) Di Jalan Kiara Condong Kota Bandung. In *Jurnal DIALEKTIKA : Jurnal Ilmu Sosial* (Vol. 19, Issue 2). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.54783/dialektika.v19i2.4>
- Mesiono, Nasution, inom, & Putri, E. (2024). Evaluasi Kebijakan Kepala Sekolah Dalam Mewujudkan Visi Dan Misi Di Mas Pab 1 Sampali. *IHSANIKA : Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 2(3), 382–398. <https://doi.org/10.59841/ihsanika.v2i3.1664>
- Mukhlis, N. M., & Abdulkadir, S. M. (2022). Hubungan Sumber Daya Penghidupan Dengan Adaptasi Strategi Penghidupan Rumah Tangga Di Tengah Pandemi Covid-19 (Kasus: Rumah Tangga Pedagang Pasar Kapuh Di Provinsi Kalimantan Selatan). *Jurnal Sains Komunikasi Dan Pengembangan Masyarakat [JSKPM]*, 6(2), 269–277. <https://doi.org/10.29244/jskpm.v6i2.977>
- Nadila, D. (2023). Evaluasi Kebijakan Kurikulum Merdeka Dengan Menggunakan Model William Dunn. *JPSS: Jurnal Pendidikan Sang Surya*, 9(1), 107–113. <https://doi.org/10.56959>
- Ningsih, R., & Megawati, S. (2022). Analisis Implementasi Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Pelataran Di Pasar Tradisional Semampir Kabupaten Probolinggo. *Publika*, 1053–1064. <https://doi.org/10.26740/publika.v10n4.p1053-1064>
- Persada, M. A., Fatmawati, R., & Rahayu, M. J. (2023). Dampak Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima (Pkl) Di Taman Pakujoyo Terhadap Kondisi Sosial Ekonomi. *Desa-Kota*, 5(2), 78. <https://doi.org/10.20961/desa-kota.v5i2.57815.78-86>
- Phafiandita, A. N., Permadani, A., Pradani, A. S., & Wahyudi, M. I. (2022). Urgensi Evaluasi Pembelajaran Di Kelas. *JIRA: Jurnal Inovasi Dan Riset Akademik*, 3(2), 111–121. <https://doi.org/10.47387/jira.v3i2.262>
- Pristika, B., & Kurniawan, B. (2021). Evaluasi Kebijakan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Jawa Timur. *Publika*, 241–254. <https://doi.org/10.26740/publika.v9n2.p241-254>

- Putri, M. A., Mefiana, N. S., Ambarwati, P. A., Hermawan, R. P., & Amira, Z. R. (2024). Evaluasi Kebijakan Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL) Di Alun-Alun Lembang. *Jurnal Pariwisata Dan Perhotelan*, 1(3), 14. <https://doi.org/10.47134/pjpp.v1i3.2522>
- Rohmawati, I., & Harsono, D. (2024). Evaluasi Kebijakan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Kapanewon Wonosari Kabupaten Gunungkidul. *Journal Of Public Policy And Administration Research*, 2(4), 1–13.
- Rosandi Sakir, A., Pratiwi Lukman, J., & Rajab, M. (2024). Upaya Pemerintah Daerah Dalam Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Kabupaten Soppeng. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.51826/fokus.v22i1.1047>
- Rupiarsieh, & Mustiana. (2023). Implementasi Kebijakan Administrasi Kependudukan Di Kabupaten Bojonegoro. . *Journal of Public Administration Studies*, 8(2), 56-68. <https://doi.org/10.55884/jarvic.v2i4.112>
- Septian, E. (2022). Transformasi Konflik Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Kawasan Malioboro, Kota Yogyakarta. *Kolaborasi: Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 8(3), 327–345. <https://doi.org/10.26618/kjap.v8i3.9190>
- Septian, E. , & Wulandari, S. (2023). Strategi Implementasi Kebijakan Penataan Pkl Di Era New Normal. . *Journal of Government Studies*, 4(2), 78–91.
- Sintani, P., Arifa Nurlianti, Abdul Halim, & Mellyana Candra. (2023). Persepsi Pedagang Kaki Lima Terhadap Kebijakan Pemerintah Di Laman Boenda Kota Tanjungpinang. *Journal of Research and Development on Public Policy*, 2(4), 205–221. <https://doi.org/10.58684/jarvic.v2i4.112>
- Stewart, J. (2020). 'One Of The Greatest Human Beings Of Our Time': Titmuss's Influence On North American Thinking On Social Welfare. In *Richard Titmuss* (pp. 423–438). Policy Press. <https://doi.org/10.51952/9781447341062.ch024>
- Suprastiyo, A., & Kumala Sari, A. (2022). Model Pengembangan Kebijakan Relokasi Pkl Berbasis Pemberdayaan Masyarakat. *Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Manajemen Publik*, 6(4), 145–158.
- Taufiq, A. , & Kasiemi, S. (2022). Analisis Kebijakan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima: Studi Kasus Di Kabupaten Bojonegoro. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik Dan Kebijakan*, , 5(1), 12–25.
- Vasthi, T., Kusbandrijo, B., & Hartono, S. (2024). Evaluasi Pembinaan Program Anak Penyandang Kesejahteraan Sosial Di Kampung Anak Negeri Dinas Sosial Kota Surabaya. *Concept: Journal of Social Humanities and Education*, 3(2), 231–241. <https://doi.org/10.55606/concept.v3i2.1265>
- Yunitasari, D., Arnyana, I. B. P., & Dantes, N. (2023). Implementasi Kebijakan Pendidikan Dasar (Definisi, Aktor Pelaksana, Arena/Konteks, Jenis, Dan Langkah Kebijakan Pendidikan Dasar). *JPPI (Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Indonesia)*, 9(3), 1506. <https://doi.org/10.29210/020232886>
- Zulhijahyanti, H., Ayu, K., Safira, A., Saputri, L. L., & Permana, E. (2021). Strategi Mempertahankan Usaha Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL) Di Masa Pandemi Covid19. 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.32493/Inovasi.v8i1.p21-29.11490>